

2013

Faculty of Political
Science, Ankara
University

Utku Balaban

[THE NOTION OF REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND INDUSTRIALIZATION IN THE KEY STRATEGIC DOCUMENTS IN TURKEY, 2014: A CONTENT ANALYSIS]

This report is part of the project “Secondary Cities” supported by European Commission’s Marie Curie Career Integration Fund.

THE CONTENT ANALYSIS OF THE LEGISLATIVE AND POLICY DOCUMENTS

In order to illustrate the key structural dynamics of the policymaking concerning regional and industrial development in Turkey, this deliverable tackles the issue under the three following sections. The first section focuses on the strategic objectives of the three key national government agencies, namely Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology, Ministry of Development, and Ministry of Economy.

The second section summarizes the related parts of the key policy documents that state the vision of the government, its strategic objectives, priority axes, and horizontal policy areas concerning the related issues.

The last section focuses on the following four legislative documents that provide the major incentives for industrial investment in developing areas of the country.

1. The Law for Small and Medium Enterprises Development (SMED-KOSGEB)
2. The Law for Organized Industrial Zones
3. The Law for Investment Incentives
4. The Law for Development Agencies

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES OF THE KEY ACTING GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

Three government agencies coordinate the nationwide policies concerning industrial and regional development: Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology, Ministry of Development, and Ministry of Economy.

Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology is responsible for coordinating the industry-oriented R&D activities in the country and developing national strategies for individual sectors. The Ministry's most relevant responsibility for the current project is its duty to permit the establishment of the organized industrial districts (OIZs). As we will see in the following deliverables, the OIZs play a major role in the secondary cities of Turkey. Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology state its vision and strategic objectives in its latest strategic plan as follows.

Strategic Objectives of the Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In collaboration with the related parties and along with the policy priorities, strategies, and related subsidies, to assure the planned development of industry and to establish an industrial structure that uses high technology, decreases the dependency on foreign resources, and produces a higher value added 2. Within the context of policies of science, technology, and innovation, to strengthen the technological structure of the country's industry by transforming the produced knowledge into economic value added and by preserving the existing knowledge, to develop the research infrastructure and collaboration between university and industry, to increase the capacity of entrepreneurship, innovativeness, and industrial R&D 3. To pioneer the formation of a consumption and market structure that is safe, sustainable, environment-friendly, increasingly efficient, and compatible with the EU norms 4. To develop solutions and diagnose the actual problems within the scope of duty of the Ministry with reports, scientific researches and publications, indicators, and activities 5. To enhance the institutional infrastructure of the Ministry and to develop the international collaboration

The Ministry's strategic objectives have an industry-oriented focus and emphasize the need to strengthen connections between R&D and industrial activities. Three major goals are set in relation to the industrial development: the use of high technology, reduction of the dependency on foreign resources, and production of higher value added. The means to achieve these goals are the development of the research infrastructure, collaboration between industry and university, and activities to increase the capacity of entrepreneurship, innovativeness, and industrial R&D.

As the table above illustrates, the Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology do not have any strategic objectives about the regional dispersion of the R&D activities in general and the industry-university collaboration in particular. Similarly, there is no emphasis about the regional disparities concerning the industrial production as well as R&D activities. In this regard, the Ministry's overall policy orientations lack a strategic focus about the industrial and scientific collaboration among enterprises and related institutions such as universities in different regions of the country.

The second government office that takes a primary role in the coordination and planning of the activities related to regional and industrial development is the Ministry of Development. The Ministry was established in 2011. Until then, the agency was an undersecretariat under the auspices of the Prime Minister's office. The former name of the organization was the State Planning Organization (SPO). The interviews conducted with the government officials in Ankara revealed that the transformation of the SPO into an independent Ministry was actually a form of

organizational demotion. Since the SPO was directly answering to the Prime Minister, the strategic documents and policy suggestions by the SPO immediately became directives upon the approval of the Prime Minister to be followed by all other related ministries. The former SPO's most important duty was to prepare the national development plans. The latest plan will be assessed in the following section of this deliverable. This task is now taken up by the Ministry of Development. However, the same interviews conducted with government officials in Ankara revealed that the relative importance of the national development plans has been diminishing in overall policymaking. For that matter, the most relevant tasks of this Ministry for the current project are to coordinate the Regional Development Agencies, which were established in 2006. These agencies coordinate the development-related activities within their jurisdiction of action, allocate some funds for local development projects, and prepare regional development plans. The Ministry's strategic plan enlists its strategic objectives as follows.

Strategic Objectives of the Ministry of Development
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To pursue activities that guide the public and private sector and to provide new opportunities in the economic, social, and cultural sphere 2. To prepare the main policy documents such as plans, programs, and strategies concerning the development process of our country with a comprehensive and strategic perspective as well as with a dynamic and participatory attitude 3. To increase the effectiveness of implementation of the main strategy and policy documents, primarily the Development Plans and Annual Programs 4. To ensure the effective allocation and use of the resources for the public investments and to manage the public investment process along with the Development Plan, programs and strategy documents 5. To develop central and regional policies and strategies with regard to regional development, to improve the institutional quality of these policies and strategies, and to guide and coordinate their implementation 6. To develop and coordinate the policies and strategies related to our country's accession process to the EU 7. To strengthen the bilateral and multilateral economic relations with neighboring and other countries and to help our country to play an effective role in the economic and regional collaboration organizations 8. To develop the State Planning Organization's human resources, work processes, organizational and knowledge infrastructure in alignment with the missions of the Ministry

The table above reveals that the Ministry's major role is to prepare the policy documents concerning development and public investment. However, the Ministry is mostly exempt of the power to allocate the actual resources. In this regard, the Ministry is assigned to determine the general strategy of development rather than to actually implement it. In this regard, as noted

above, the Regional Development Agencies, which have a significant autonomy in implementation, play a more important role at the local level than the Ministry itself.

Another point worth to emphasize is the disregard for industrial development. In other words, while the Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology fails to clearly state a strategic objective regarding regional development, the Ministry of Development fails to set a goal concerning industrial development. This may be regarded as a consequence of the institutional division of labor among the acting agencies.

The Ministry of Economy was established in 2011 as well. This ministry had been the Undersecretariat of Foreign Trade until this year and it was under the auspices of the Prime Minister's office as well as the earlier State Planning Office. Thus, activities under the jurisdiction of the Ministry are mostly related to foreign trade. However, as the interviews in Ankara revealed, the Ministry also implements the Investment Incentive Program launched in 2012 in accordance with the Council of Minister's Decree No 2012/3305. This program is one of the most extensive sources of subsidies to be allocated to the less developed regions of the country with an emphasis on industrial activities. Accordingly, the Ministry of Economy is now one of the most important players within the government structure in terms of the regional and industrial and development policies. However, this investment scheme is not reflected in the strategic documents of the Ministry, which are enlisted below. The emphasis is on the improvement of the foreign trade relations as well as policies to attract foreign direct investment.

Strategic Objectives of the Ministry of Economy
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. To develop the production of goods and services and their exports; to increase the exports of the goods with high value added and in competitive sectors2. To improve the investment environment and to develop the investment potential of our country3. To take the measures to prevent the harms and threats caused by imports4. To ensure the supply of high quality and safe products5. To pursue the bilateral, regional, and multilateral commercial and investment relations in the interest of our country6. To raise the awareness about the foreign trade and investment in the country7. To continue with the institutional development

KEY POLICY DOCUMENTS

The following documents were assessed during the first phase of the project in order to depict the general dynamics of policymaking in Turkey with regard to regional and industrial development.

1. 10th Development Plan

2. Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014
3. National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft: Bu metinde bölgesel kalkınma agency'lerine ilişkin bir chart vardı. Onu kullan.
4. Regional Competitiveness OP
5. Human Resources OP
6. KOSGEB Strategic Action Plan 2007-2009 (Objectives)
7. 2012 Activity Report of Development Agencies

The 10th Development Plan by law provides the policy framework for all other policy documents. In other words, the policy documents mentioned above need to comply with the overarching goals stated in the Development Plan. Accordingly, the Development Plan needs to be assessed in more detail independently of the other documents tackled below. The remaining documents will be comparatively assessed in terms of their vision statement, strategic objectives, priority axes, and horizontal policy areas.

TENTH DEVELOPMENT PLAN

The development plans in Turkey are legally binding documents that dictate the policy priorities for the government as well as the policy indicators if relevant. The following subtitles are directly or indirectly related to the research subject as stated in the research proposal:

2.1.11 Employment and Labor Conditions

2.2.1. Growth and Employment

2.2.11. Transformation in the Manufacturing Industry

2.2.12. Entrepreneurship and SMEs

2.3.1. Regional Development and Regional Competitiveness

2.3.2. Spatial Development and Planning

OBJECTIVES, GOALS AND POLICIES IN THE TENTH DEVELOPMENT PLAN
2.1. QUALIFIED INDIVIDUALS, STRONG SOCIETY
2.1.11 Employment and Labor Conditions
313. To form a labor market that assures decent jobs with highly qualified labor force, gender equality, occupational safety, and flexicurity
2.2. INNOVATIVE PRODUCTION, STABLE AND HIGH GROWTH
2.2.1. Growth and Employment
439. High and stable growth is the major goal.
440. The main strategy for high and stable growth is to develop an outward-oriented and competitive production structure under the leadership of the private sector.
441. Productivity increases lead to the economic growth and the sustainable and effective use of the scarce resources. Thus, economic growth should depend on the productivity increases that will assure the sustainability of economic growth and social welfare. In this regard, the Development Plan gives the priority to the policies for productivity increases and the global competitiveness of the domestic economy.
442. The enhancement of the industrial sector is important in terms of the productivity increases and the growth performance. It is a critical development that resources were in recent years funneled from the industry to the sectors, which are not export-oriented with a limited competitive pressure. Similarly, the share of the manufacturing industry in the total value added has been decreasing. These two trends will in potential negatively affect the mid-term growth potential. Thus, during the implementation of the Tenth Development Plan, the priority in monetary, financial, and subsidy-related policies will focus on the enhancement of the productive areas.
443. To strengthen the macroeconomic stability with financial, monetary, and balance of payment policies, to strengthen the human capital, to increase the effectiveness of the labor market and the capacity of innovation, and to improve the physical infrastructure and the institutional quality will be the policies of priority for the growth strategy in the upcoming period.
444. Macroeconomic stability makes it possible for effective decision-making and planning for the future and, thereby, renders the optimal distribution of the economic resources in the most efficient way possible. In the last period, to sustain the stability and to improve it further is a prerequisite for the achievement for the Plan's objectives. In this regard, steps will be taken to increase the quality of the public resources and spending. It will be a policy priority that the share of the public spending will not increase in the total income and the public spending will not crowd out the private sector. Revenue-increasing policies such as the expansion of the taxation base will make the implementation of new policies feasible. Furthermore, the monetary policy to strengthen the price stability will be continued. Moreover, policies and measure will be implemented to resolve the problem of current account deficit permanently. In addition to these steps, activities to increase the domestic savings, which tend to have decreased within the last decade, will be continued.
445. Turkey has a young and dynamic population that supports Turkey's fast development. In order to utilize the related opportunities, the labor force participation needs to increase and the quantitative and particularly qualitative structure of education should be improved. Furthermore, education policies should be aligned with the needs of the labor market. The highly qualified labor force from overseas will be employed in Turkey by providing the incoming employees with favorable work conditions. Such policies will be the measures for the period when the population growth will slow down.
446. Innovation and use of technology is an important factor that provides comparative advantage for countries. Thus, the development and commercialization of the technology contributes to growth as well as the profitability and investment opportunities for the firms. Thus, R&D and innovation activities, which take the environmental issues and the primacy of the private sector into account, will be increased. The resulting outputs will be trademarked and commercialized.
447. The underinvestment in physical infrastructure is an obstacle to the country's development. Thus, without wasting the resources, the public infrastructure investment will support the development of production in economy. The public investment will motivate the private sector investment and, thereby, increase the output. Similarly, the public investment will contribute to the efficiency-based growth dynamics.
448. Institutional quality both at the enterprise and country levels will be improved. Informal economy and corruption will be struggled with. Taxation policies will be predictable and stable. Intellectual property and patent rights will be protected. The effective functioning of the markets will be ensured and the investment environment will be strengthened.
449. The GDP will grow 5.5 percent per annum during the Plan period. At the end of the period, the GDP will be \$1.3 trillion and the GDP per capital will be \$16,000.
450. Total Factor Productivity will increase 1.1 percent per annum during the Plan period. This increase is planned to derive from the manufacturing industries that produce for commercial goods. This is essential for healthy growth of the economy.
451. The reversal of the tendency of the decline of the share of the industry in the GDP is of critical importance for stable and high growth rates. A strong manufacturing industry is needed to realize the goals for 2023. The industry is projected to grow by 6.4 percent per annum during the Plan period and its share in the GDP is expected to increase at some level. Agriculture is expected to grow by 3.1 percent and to decrease its share in GDP to 6.8 percent, while the service sector is expected to grow at the same pace as the GDP.
452. During the Plan period, the creation of 4 million jobs is projected as well as growth in employment by 2.9 percent per annum. The share of the agricultural employment will drop to 21.9 percent and employment will shift to more productive areas. Fast increases in employment and policies about labor markets that help women to participate to the labor market will increase the total labor force participation rate to 53.8 percent with an annual increase of 2.7 percent. As a result of these developments, the unemployment rate will gradually drop from 9.2 percent to 7.2 percent.
453. Fixed capital accumulation will be supported during the Plan period in order to increase the productive capacity. In this regard, fixed capital investment is projected increase by 8.9 percent in private sector and by 8.5 percent in total sector during Plan period. Similarly, shifting the investment from unproductive sectors such as construction to productive areas is critical for the stability of growth.
2.2.11. Transformation in the Manufacturing Industry
649. The main goal is to set the reorientation toward a high value-added structure and to increase the share of the high-technology sectors by transforming the manufacturing sector in order to increase the share of Turkey in global exports and to increase Turkey's international competitiveness.
650. The focus points of the transformation of the manufacturing industry are innovativeness and firm capabilities, active involvement of regions in production, integration among the sectors, green technology and production, and the diversity in foreign markets.
651. One of the goals is to raise the increase of the total factor productivity of the industry above its long-term average.
652. In the long run, our country is projected to be the production center of Euroasia. In this regard, the manufacturing industry is during the Plan period intended to create higher value added, to produce and use environment-friendly technology, to develop its capacities incessantly, to

respond to the demands by the future's commercial world, to gain sustainable global competitiveness, to increase the extent of contribution of the regional potentials to the economy, to provide the effectiveness of the input supply, to decrease the dependence on the imports of the investment and intermediary goods.
2.2.12. Entrepreneurship and SMEs
689. The main goal is to raise the contribution of the SMEs to the economic growth by increasing their competitiveness. In this regard, enterprises, which grow fast or have the potential to grow, will be primarily supported as well as the innovative SMEs in terms of their products, services, and business models.
2.3. HABITABLE SPACES, SUSTAINABLE ENVIRONMENT
2.3.1. Regional Development and Regional Competitiveness
915. The regional development policies will reduce the regional disparities, help the welfare to disperse across the country equally, and help all regions to utilize their potentials and to contribute to the national growth and development at the maximum level.
2.3.2. Spatial Development and Planning
943. The goal is to provide the country with new spaces with highest standards that are compatible with the country's geographical conditions, the rural-urban distinction, the historical, cultural and environmental values, and the social and human needs.

The table below provides the related objectives, goals, and policies for these themes. The first point to note is the high number of objectives set for the policies related to growth and employment in Section 2.2.1. Paragraph 442 points out that the growth rate of manufacturing industry is not satisfactory, as the resources have been channeled to sectors, which are not export-oriented. The low growth rate in the value added by the manufacturing industry is presented as another problem. Thus, the Plan dictates resource transfers to the manufacturing industry. This is certainly compatible with the analysis in the second Deliverable about the performance of the manufacturing industry in Turkey: the predominant portion of the output by the manufacturing sectors is exported to foreign markets. Thus, manufacturing industries are regarded as a major instrument to overcome the chronic current account deficit, which Turkey has been struggling with for the last decade. For that matter, Paragraph 443 notes the problem of current account deficit as well as the fiscal constraints such as the decrease in domestic savings: the principle for the fiscal policy is to avoid the budget deficit at all costs.

Paragraphs from 445 to 449 respectively point to the strategic priorities and targets about education of the youth, innovation and technology, public infrastructure investment, institutional effectiveness about informal economy and taxation, and the growth rate of GDP. Paragraphs 452 and 453 specify the goals about job creation and fixed capital stock in the coming years. None of these paragraphs set specific goals about the manufacturing industry and regional development. Paragraph 450, however, emphasizes that the expected growth in total factor productivity will derive from the manufacturing industries. Similarly, Paragraph 451 sets 6.4 percent annual growth rate as the goal for the manufacturing industry. This is regarded as an essential prerequisite if the 2023 goals are to be achieved.¹ In general, Section 2.2.1 strongly emphasizes

¹ The 2023 goals are illustrated here: <http://blog.milliyet.com.tr/turkiye-nin-100-yilinda-2023-hedefleri/Blog/?BlogNo=380942>

the prospective role of the manufacturing industry in Turkish economy, while regional disparities are not mentioned in this section.

The two main goals set for the manufacturing industry are to have a higher value added in the total manufacturing output and to use a higher level of technology. Paragraph 650 outlines the goals for the strategy about the manufacturing industry as follows:

- Higher innovativeness and more effective firms
- Active involvement of regions in production
- Higher integration among sectors
- Green technology and production
- Diversity in foreign markets

The implication here is that regional development is given more emphasis than the sector-based concentration in policymaking.

The only part of the Plan that explicitly refers to a particular business model is Section 2.2.12. in Paragraph 689, small- and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) are given emphasis on a selective basis in that successful SMEs are to be supported.

Two sections of the Plan directly mention space-related issues. Section 2.3.1 refers to regional development and regional competitiveness and Section 2.3.2 outlines the goals about spatial development and planning. The related goals stated in Paragraph 915 and Paragraph 943 are unspecified and give no clear guidelines about the related issues. Relatively ambiguous expressions such as “helping all regions to utilize their potentials” or “providing the country with new spaces with highest standards” reveal ambivalence with regard to the policy orientations concerning this subject.

The last section of the Development Plan enlists “the Programs of Transformation of Priority”. Twenty-five programs will be pursued in the coming years by the related government agencies in accordance with the benchmarks stated in the Plan. The table below presents ten of these programs that are related to regional and industrial development.

Goals of “the Programs of Transformation of Priority” (Third Part)	The Acting Agency
1.1. Program to Increase the Efficiency in Production	Ministry of Development
To increase the contribution of the total factor productivity of the industry to growth beyond 20 percent.	
1.7. Program to Improve the Business and Investment Environment	Ministry of Economy
To increase the share of the private sector's investment in GDP to 19.3 percent	
To raise the cumulative foreign direct investment (except for real estate) to \$93.9 billion during the Plan period	
To rank within the first 50 countries in the Index for Business Environment	
To increase the investment place allocation by improving the related processes	
1.8. The Program to Increase the Effectiveness of the Labor Market	Ministry of Labor and Social Security
To increase the labor force participation and employment by women to 34.9 percent and 31 percent respectively by the end of the Plan period	
To extend the flexible work practices	
To strengthen the connection between social assistance and employment	
To increase the effectiveness of the employment subsidies	
1.9. The Program to Minimize the Informal Economy	Revenue Administration
To decrease the share of informal economy in GDP by five points	
To decrease the rate of informal employment in non-agricultural sectors by five points	
1.13. The Program to Generate Energy from Domestic Sources	Ministry of Energy and Natural Resources
To increase the share of the domestic energy resources (including domestic and overseas oil and natural gas drilling), which was 28 percent in 2011, to 35 percent in 2018	
To increase the lignite-derived power generation to 60 billion kWh in 2018, which was 39 billion kWh in 2012	
To increase the hydroelectrical capacity by 10,000 MW during the Plan period	
1.18. The Program to Transform from Transportation to Logistics	Ministry of Development, Ministry of Transportation, Maritime and Communication
To strengthen Turkey's international position in logistics	
To decrease the cost of logistics in the total costs of the industrial products	
To shorten the duration for the delivery of the final products to the consumer markets	
1.19. The Program to Improve the Basic and Occupational Skills	Ministry of Labor and Social Security
To improve the weight of the basic skills in the curricula at all levels of education	
To develop life-long learning programs about basic skills	
To establish stronger connections between the labor market and the education system	
To decrease the number of young people neither employed nor in the education system	
1.20. The Program to Attract Highly-Qualified People to the Country	The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey
To attract more highly qualified people from overseas including foremost our citizens	
To increase the number of international researchers working for education and research facilities on contract	
1.23. The Program to Strengthen the Local Institutional Capacity	Ministry of Development
To increase the efficiency of the provision of local services	
To improve the effectiveness of the human resource management of the administrations and institutions within the target group	
To improve the project management capacity of the administrations and institutions within the target group	
To increase the contribution of the NGOs (including occupational organizations) and universities to the formulation and implementation of the policymaking at the local level	
1.24. The Urban Renewal Program for Competitiveness and Social Harmony	Ministry of Environment and Urbanization
To develop new models of urban renewal compatible with different terrains and contexts	
To provide the public resources from the value gains that derive from the urban renewal	
To develop new products and technologies	
To develop new models of housing that focus on low and medium income groups	
To strengthen the social dimension in the implementation of the planning and implementation of the projects	
To facilitate the social harmony in metropolitan areas	
1.25 The Program to Develop the International Collaboration Infrastructure for Development	Ministry of Development
To improve the legal and strategic framework for Turkey's international collaboration infrastructure	
To improve the institutional and human capacity for Turkey's international collaboration	
To raise the awareness of the national and international public	
To render Turkey the regional center for international development collaboration	

Three programs directly pertain to the dynamics of the labor market in Turkey (1.8, 1.19 and 1.20). Program 1.7 and Program 1.9 aim to reshape the business practices in Turkey. The former is intended to improve the business conditions for private sector and to create favorable conditions for international capital. Program 1.13 and Program 1.18 are sector-oriented. The former aims to increase the domestic energy output, while the latter calls for new initiatives to improve the logistics sector. The choice of these sectors is not a haphazard one, because both are the fastest growing sectors in Turkey. Program 1.23 and Program 1.25 are the only programs that have some connotations about regional development. Program 1.24 sets a number of goals about urban development.

The Ministry of Development is the general coordinator of the highest number of these programs. The performance indicators for most of the programs are not assigned quantifiable targets. Most of the goals, as seen in the table above, are also not assigned any quantifiable benchmark.

OTHER STRATEGIC DOCUMENTS

The following documents specify the actions to be taken along with the goals stated in the Tenth Development Plan. These documents were assessed for the project in order to identify the parallelisms and differences in terms of their policy orientations:

1. Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014
2. National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft: Bu metinde bolgesel kalkinma agency'lerine iliskin bir chart vardi. Onu kullan.
3. Regional Competitiveness OP
4. Human Resources OP
5. KOSGEB Strategic Action Plan 2007-2009 (Objectives)
6. 2012 Activity Report of Development Agencies

This section will provide a comparative assessment of the vision statements, strategic objectives, priority axes, horizontal policy areas for the documents that have the related sections.

VISION STATEMENT	
Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014	Becoming the production base of Eurasia in medium and high- tech products
Human Resources Operational Program	To support the transition to a knowledge-based economy capable of sustainable economic growth with more and better jobs and greater social cohesion
KOSGEB Strategic Plan 2011-2015	To extend the role of the SMEs in economic and social development by providing high quality services and support that aim to expand the innovative culture and to improve the competitiveness of the SMEs
National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft	A country that is socio-economically and spatially integrated with competitive and rich regions and with fewer regional disparities
Regional Competitiveness Operational Program	Increasing regional competitiveness by supporting enterprises
Development Agencies Activity Report, 2012	<p>Each Development Agency has its own vision statement with similar themes and expressions. Vision statements for the Agencies serving Denizli, Gaziantep, and Kayseri are as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1.South Aegean Development Agency (Denizli): To provide sustainable and balanced development in its region, to take a pioneering role in the development of its region, and to establish national and international reputation 2.Silk Road Development Agency (Gaziantep): To generate ideas and policies that connect its region to the future, to pioneer in sustainable development, to be effective, modern, helping, and innovative 3.Middle Anatolian Development Agency (Kayseri): To achieve a dynamic and strong Middle Anatolia that develops in a planned, multidimensional, and balanced fashion at the center of Turkey

The vision statements of the documents above emphasize the notion of development. The table below illustrates the frequencies of the selected keywords from the fifty-two words in the table above except for articles, particles, adverbs and verbs. “Development” and “region” are the most commonly used keywords in the vision statements, while the term “industry” is not used in any of these documents. The frequently used adjectives are economic, sustainable, competitive, social, innovative, and balanced. The notion of “disparity” is explicitly uttered once as well as the notion of “enterprise”. However, the SMEs are unsurprisingly mentioned in KOSGEB’s vision statement twice. The firsthand impression from this assessment is that the vision statements emphasize regional development more than industrial development with a focus on private enterprises’ activities rather than NGOs or governmental agencies.

Keyword	Frequency	Keyword	Frequency
development	8	balanced	2
region	6	high-technology	2
economic	3	SMEs	2
sustainable	3	disparities	1
competitive	3	knowledge-based	1
support	3	center	1
social	3	cohesion	1
innovative	2	enterprises	1
pioneer	2	international	1

The strategic objectives of the documents assessed in this deliverable point to the following themes in policymaking. First, there is a strong emphasis on high technology, R&D, and innovation. Second, employment is not a major concern of the policymaking. In fact, objectives concerning the labor force primarily pertain to the upskilling of the population, rather than job creation. Third, except for Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014 and KOSGEB Strategic Plan, regional and territorial disparities are mentioned in strategic objectives. In the same manner, the latest draft of the National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) does not set a goal about industrialization. That these two documents fail to mention the subject of regional development gives a signal about the lack of connectivity in policymaking for regional and industrial development.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES	
Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Increasing the weight of mid- and high-tech sectors in production and exports 2. Transition to high added value products in low-tech sectors 3. Increasing the weight of companies that can continuously improve their skills (strong)
Human Resources Operational Program	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To take advantage of Turkey's demographic opportunity window through better employment, education and social inclusion policies 2. To reduce regional and territorial disparities
KOSGEB Strategic Plan 2011-2015	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To develop the management skills and institutional capacities of the SMEs 2. To increase the R&D and innovation-oriented activities of the SMEs 3. To motivate the establishment of new enterprises and to develop the innovativeness culture 4. To ensure the development of the Agency's high quality services
National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To ensure geographically balanced development and to overcome regional disparities 2. To utilize the potential of all regions, to increase their competitiveness and to increase their contribution to the national growth and development 3. To consolidate the economic and social integration 4. To support a balanced spatial and residential development across the country
Regional Competitiveness Operational Program	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Enhancement of physical and financial infrastructure 2. Increasing the business stock 3. Increasing employment creation capacity of the productive sector 4. Enhancing added value of production base
Development Agencies Activity Report, 2012 (p. 18)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To mobilize the potential of the individual regions 2. To improve the level of contribution of all regions to the national economy 3. To decrease the differences of development among and within regions 4. To increase the competitiveness of the developed regions at the global scale

The table below illustrates the frequencies of the selected keywords from the sixty-six words in the table above except for articles, particles, adverbs and verbs. The frequencies illustrate the parallelism in terms of the emphasis points. The two terms “development” and “regional” are the most frequently used ones. The most frequently used adjectives are regional, balanced, economic, social, high-tech, spatial, global, and territorial. The most frequently used nouns are development, production, sector, competitiveness, disparities, employment, innovation, skills, SMEs, value-added, companies, enterprises, and R&D.

Keyword	Frequency	Keyword	Frequency
develop/development	8	SMEs	2
regional	7	social	2
production	4	value-added	2
sector	3	national	2
balanced	2	companies	1
capacities	2	enterprises	1
competitiveness	2	high-tech	1
disparities	2	spatial	1
economic	2	global	1
employment	2	R&D	1
innovation	2	territorial	1
skills	2		

PRIORITY AXES	
Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014 (Sectoral Policies)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sectoral strategies will be formulated for automotive, machinery, white goods, electronics, iron and steel, wood works, paper and furniture, and food sectors under the auspices of the Ministry of Industry and Trade. 2. New initiatives for increasing the share of mid- and high-tech sectors in production and exports will be established; steps will be taken to enable Turkey to become a production base in automotive, white goods, machinery and electronics sectors. Restructuring in traditional sectors will be encouraged which allow adaptation in international competition. 3. A clustering policy will be developed, and analysis to determine clustering potentials will be carried out. The cooperation among businesses, notably in OIZs, will be supported. 4. Sectoral and regional development policies will serve the purpose of increasing the efficiency and competitiveness of the regions, taking into consideration harmonization with the EU. Regional development strategies will be designed and implemented in accordance with the results of the clustering and value chain analysis in such a way that is compatible with industrial strategy. 5. “The Entrepreneur Information System” allowing the investors in the market and other users to make better decisions by collecting, updating and offering data on industrial activities in a holistic, systematic and matching manner will be established in coordination with the Ministry of Industry and Trade.
National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To increase the competitiveness and outwardness of the industrial growth centers 2. To ensure the convergence of the Priority I Provinces with the rest of the country 3. To trigger the development in underdeveloped regions with the regional growth poles 4. To precipitate the development in rural areas 5. To improve the governmentality of the regional development and the institutional capacity 6. To develop cross-border and interregional collaboration 7. To harmonize the public investment and support policies with the goals of regional development 8. To support the sustainable environment and green economy 9. To improve the competitiveness of the regions 10. To improve the transportation network and the accessibility
Regional Competitiveness Operational Program	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Improvement of Business Environment 2. Strengthening of enterprise capacity and foster entrepreneurship
Human Resources Operational Program	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To attract and retain more people in employment, particularly by increasing labour force participation of women, and decrease unemployment rates, especially for young people. 2. To enhance investment in human capital by increasing the quality of education, improving the linkage between education and the labour market, and raising enrolment rates at all levels of education, especially for girls 3. To increase adaptability of workers, enterprises and entrepreneurs, in particular by promoting lifelong learning and encouraging investment in human resources by enterprises and workers 4. To promote an inclusive labour market with opportunities for disadvantaged people, with a view to their sustainable integration into the labour force and combat all forms of discrimination in the labour market 5. To improve the coordination, control and implementation of HRD OP and to assist the Operating Structure and relevant institutions in the further programming, monitoring, evaluation and implementing tasks.
Development Agencies Activity Report, 2012 (p.18)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To speed up regional development, to ensure the sustainability and to decrease the differences in development among and within the regions by mobilizing the local potentials 2. To ensure the development of regions in accordance with the strategies developed by the related agencies 3. To ensure the use of resources on site in an effective manner 4. To support the activities that increase the output and employment in individual regions 5. To contribute to the development of human and institutional capacity 6. To develop and support the competitiveness and entrepreneurship 7. To develop the collaboration between public, private, and non-governmental agencies

Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014 dictates the preparation of strategy papers for eight sectors. The Document presents a number of “evaluations of sectoral competitiveness and policy areas” in its annex section about the following sectors: automotive, machinery, white goods, electric and electronics, textiles, food, iron and steel. Four sectors are particularly emphasized: automotive, white goods, machinery and electronics. Clustering as well as cooperation in OIZs are mentioned. The following sentence gives some clues about Turkey’s industrial strategy’s connection with its strategy of regional development: “Regional development strategies will be designed and implemented in accordance with the results of the clustering and value chain analysis in such a way that is compatible with industrial strategy”. In fact, regional development strategies are shaped according to the successful clusters and value chains cutting across different regions.

The priority axes in the latest draft of National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) assign the Priority I provinces and rural areas as the primary subjects of policy intervention. Industrial growth centers and regional growth poles are regarded as the primary spatial units to implement the related policies, while public investment is seen as an essential component of policymaking. The notion of regional development is characterized as the competitiveness of the regions with a sustainable environment and green economy and with an outward economic orientation. Effective transportation network and high accessibility of individual regions are regarded as another policy priority. The emphasis on the industrial growth centers points to an overlapping perspective shared by this document and the Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014.

The Regional Competitiveness Operational Program’s policy (RCOP) priorities are explicitly business-oriented. RCOP is one of the basic documents for the implementation of the Instrument for Pre Accession (IPA) in Turkey the operational program’s main goal is “to prepare Turkey for the implementation and management of the Community’s cohesion policy and thus to support Turkey in its preparation for EU membership” in order “to increase the competitiveness of Turkish economy to converge with the economy of the EU and to reduce regional socio-economic disparities”². However, the comprehensiveness of the subject is not reflected in the stated policy priorities.

² RCOP, p. vii.

The latest Human Resources Operational Program (HRDOP) emphasizes the chronic problems of the labor markets in Turkey such as low labor force participation, social exclusion of the disadvantaged people, and low skill level. Within this context, there is no direct reference to regional disparities and industrial development.

The latest activity report of the Development Agencies does not make an explicit reference to industrial development. The use of local resources is emphasized as well as the local human and institutional capacity, competitiveness, and entrepreneurship. The emphasis on the need to develop the collaboration among (the local) public, private, and non-governmental agencies is indicative of the problems experienced in this regard. In general, the priority axes in this document focus on the transfer of the policymaking power to the local level at this moment, rather than description of the actual policy priorities concerning specific issues of regional development.

The table below illustrates the frequencies of the selected keywords from the hundred fifty-one words in the table above except for articles, particles, adverbs and verbs.

Keyword	Frequency	Keyword	Frequency	Keyword	Frequency
develop/developed/development	15	automotive	2	effective	1
regional/regions	12	business	2	efficiency	1
enterprise/entrepreneur/entrepreneurship	7	collaboration	2	furniture	1
sectoral/sectors	6	coordination	2	girls	1
competition/competitiveness	5	electronics	2	information	1
industrial	5	employment	2	international	1
labour	5	environment	2	interregional	1
investment	4	growth	2	iron	1
market	4	machinery	2	OIZs	1
capacity	3	trade	2	output	1
clustering	3	workers	2	steel	1
education	3	cooperation	1	unemployment	1
sustainability	3	disadvantaged	1	underdeveloped	1
activities	2	discrimination	1	white goods	1
agencies	2	economy	1	women	

The notions of “development” and “region” are the most frequently used concepts in this section of the aforementioned documents as well as in the previously mentioned sections of the same documents. Unlike in earlier sections, particular industrial sectors such as electronics or machinery and regions such as Priority I provinces are specified as the unit of operation for the prospective activities. The references to both regional and industrial development are also made

in respective documents. Except for HRDOP, gender aspect is missing, while a pro-business attitude is particularly visible in RCOP.

Horizontal Policy Areas	
Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Investment and business environment 2. International trade and investment 3. Skills and human resources 4. SMEs' (Small and Medium Sized Enterprises) Access to Finance 5. Technological Development of Companies 6. Infrastructure Sectors and Input Costs 7. Environment 8. Regional Development
National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To improve the governmentality of the regional development and the institutional capacity 2. To develop cross-border and interregional collaboration 3. To harmonize the public investment and support policies with the goals of regional development 4. To support the sustainable environment and green economy 5. To improve the competitiveness of the regions 6. To improve the transportation network and the accessibility
Regional Competitiveness OP	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Equal opportunities for men and women 2. Environmental protection 3. Participation of civil society 4. Geographic and sectoral concentration
Human Resources OP	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Equal opportunities for men and women – a mandatory integral part of all policies and practices financed under the structural support; 2. Sustainable development and environmental protection 3. Participation of civil society 4. Concerns of disadvantaged persons 5. Good governance 6. Geographic, sectoral and thematic concentration

The table below illustrates the frequencies of the selected keywords from the sixty-one words in the table above except for articles, particles, adverbs and verbs.

Keyword	Frequency	Keyword	Frequency	Keyword	Frequency
development	5	women	2	infrastructure	1
environment	5	business	1	institutional	1
regional	4	capacity	1	international	1
investment	3	collaboration	1	interregional	1
sectoral	3	companies	1	resources	1
civil	2	competitiveness	1	skills	1
concentration	2	costs	1	SMEs	1
participation	2	disadvantaged	1	technological	1
protection	2	economy	1	trade	1
society	2	enterprises	1	transportation	1
sustainable	2	finance	1		

“Environment” appears to be the subject of one key horizontal policy area that is covered by all documents by the latest draft of National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023). Albeit with different terms, all of the documents also regard regional development as a horizontal policy area. RCOP and HRDOP do not mention business- or investment-related issues within this context. Due to RCOP’s strong pro-business emphasis in its priority axes, this policy area is out of the scope for this document in this regard. Except for the reference to the transportation network in the latest draft of National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023), there is no explicit reference to a particular industrial or non-industrial sector with regard to horizontal policy areas in any of these documents.

CONTENT ANALYSIS

A three-step content analysis is conducted in order to measure the differences in policy orientation among the aforementioned policy documents.

The first step is to extract the keywords in these documents. To this purpose, individual words in the vision statements, strategic objectives, priority axes, and horizontal policy areas of the abovementioned documents are collected in a single list. Articles, particles, adverbs, and verbs are removed from a shorter list. The final list is made up from this shorter list that has every noun and adjective in these sections of the documents. In order to be as comprehensive as possible, the final list has as many words in the shorter list as possible. Words, which have no specific content for the purposes of regional and industrial development, are removed from the shorter list. The appendix provides the initial, shorter, and final list for outside review. The table below illustrates the number of the words in these three lists for each section of the strategic policy documents.

Number of Keywords	Initial List	Shorter List	Final List	Shorter List/Final List
Vision Statement	95	51	18	0.352
Strategic Objectives	95	66	24	0.363
Priority Axes	215	151	45	0.298
Horizontal Policy Areas	77	62	33	0.532
Final Keyword List			88	

On average, 41 percent of the words in the shorter list are picked for the final list. The frequencies of the eighty-eight words in the six strategic documents were divided by the total

number of the words in the documents. The correlations among the percentages is reflected in the table below.

Correlations								
		KeywordByTotal	HRDOP	RCOP	IndStr	TenthPlan	DevAgency	BGUS
KeywordByTotal	Pearson Correlation	1	.482**	.688**	.670**	.774**	.788**	.740**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000	.000	.000	.000	.000	.000
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
HRDOP	Pearson Correlation	.482**	1	.151	.170	.256*	.161	.097
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000		.159	.113	.016	.134	.368
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
RCOP	Pearson Correlation	.688**	.151	1	.554**	.422**	.522**	.487**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.159		.000	.000	.000	.000
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
IndStr	Pearson Correlation	.670**	.170	.554**	1	.535**	.557**	.351**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.113	.000		.000	.000	.001
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
TenthPlan	Pearson Correlation	.774**	.256*	.422**	.535**	1	.680**	.547**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.016	.000	.000		.000	.000
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
DevAgency	Pearson Correlation	.788**	.161	.522**	.557**	.680**	1	.717**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.134	.000	.000	.000		.000
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
NSRD	Pearson Correlation	.740**	.097	.487**	.351**	.547**	.717**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.368	.000	.001	.000	.000	
	N	88	88	88	88	88	88	88
**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).								
*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).								
KeywordByTotal: Average of Keywords in Individual Documents/Average of Total Words in Individual Documents								
HRDOP: Human Resources Operational Program								
RCOP: Regional Competitiveness Operational Program								
IndStr: Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014								
TenthPlan: 10 th Development Plan								
DevAgency: Development Agencies Activity Report, 2012								
NSRD: National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft								

On average, the frequencies for the total number of words unsurprisingly have the highest correlations with the policy documents. The activity report of the Development Agencies and the

10th Development Plan rank the second and third. The former is the lowest level operational document among the others, while the Development Plan is the highest.

BURAYA EKLEME YAP...

The ten most commonly used words in every document make up a list of thirty-three words.

Correlations

		KeywordByTotal	HRDOP	RCOP	IndStr	TenthPlan	DevAgency	NSRD
KeywordByTotal	Pearson Correlation	1	.252	.403*	.347*	.583**	.789**	.721**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.158	.020	.048	.000	.000	.000
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33
HRDOP	Pearson Correlation	.252	1	-.208	-.158	-.046	-.105	-.162
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.158		.245	.380	.799	.560	.369
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33
RCOP	Pearson Correlation	.403*	-.208	1	.275	.036	.341	.275
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.020	.245		.121	.841	.052	.122
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33
IndStr	Pearson Correlation	.347*	-.158	.275	1	.211	.386*	.062
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.048	.380	.121		.238	.027	.730
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33
TenthPlan	Pearson Correlation	.583**	-.046	.036	.211	1	.574**	.366*
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.799	.841	.238		.000	.036
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33
DevAgency	Pearson Correlation	.789**	-.105	.341	.386*	.574**	1	.638**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.560	.052	.027	.000		.000
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33
NSRD	Pearson Correlation	.721**	-.162	.275	.062	.366*	.638**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.369	.122	.730	.036	.000	
	N	33	33	33	33	33	33	33

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

		HRDOP	RCOP	IndStr	TenthPlan	DevAgency	NSRD
HRDOP	Pearson Correlation	1	-.208	-.158	-.046	-.105	-.162
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.245	.380	.799	.560	.369
RCOP	Pearson Correlation	-.208	1	.275	.036	.341	.275
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.245		.121	.841	.052	.122
IndStr	Pearson Correlation	-.158	.275	1	.211	.386*	.062
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.380	.121		.238	.027	.730
TenthPlan	Pearson Correlation	-.046	.036	.211	1	.574**	.366
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.799	.841	.238		.000	.036
DevAgency	Pearson Correlation	-.105	.341	.386	.574**	1	.638**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.560	.052	.027	.000		.000
NSRD	Pearson Correlation	-.162	.275	.062	.366	.638**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.369	.122	.730	.036	.000	

Unsurprisingly, there are a fewer number of significant correlations among these variables, while those relations reveal two interesting connections. First, keywords in the two documents prepared for the Instrument of Pre-Accession for European Union have no significant correlation with the rest of documents and vice versa. This supports the conclusion that nationally endorsed documents have a weaker relationship with the EU-related documents in terms of focus. Second, keywords in the Turkish Industrial Strategy Document 2011-2014 have no significant correlation with the 10th Development Plan and National Strategy of Regional Development (2014-2023) Second Draft. This implies that the Industrial Strategy Document has a weak relationship with the Development Plan in terms of the wording of these two documents. The second conclusion, which is more important for the purposes of this deliverable, is that the wordings of the two documents, which are meant to draw the general strategy for the regional and industrial policies in Turkey, have a weak relationship. This can be taken as a signal for the absence of overlap between regional and industrial policies.

APPENDIX: KEYWORDS FOR THE CONTENT ANALYSIS

VISION STATEMENTS			
	Initial List (Repeated Words Removed)	Shorter List (Articles, Particles, Adverbs, and Verbs Removed)	Final List
1	a	agency	development
2	achieve	balanced	region
3	agency	base	economic
4	aim	center	sustainable
5	and	cohesion	competitive
6	are	competitive	support
7	as	country	social
8	at	culture	innovative
9	balanced	development	pioneer
10	base	disparities	balanced
11	be	dynamic	disparities
12	becoming	economic	knowledge-based
13	better	effective	center
14	by	enterprises	cohesion
15	capable	expressions	enterprises
16	center	future	international
17	cohesion	greater	high-technology
18	competitive	growth	SMEs
19	connect	high	
20	country	ideas	
21	culture	innovative	
22	development	integrated	
23	disparities	international	
24	dynamic	jobs	
25	each	knowledge-based	
26	economic	medium	
27	effective	modern	
28	enterprises	multidimensional	
29	establish	national	
30	expand	pioneer	
31	expressions.	planned	
32	extend	policies	
33	fashion	production	
34	fewer	quality	
35	follows:	region	
36	for	reputation	
37	future	rich	
38	generate	road	
39	greater	role	
40	growth	services	
41	has	similar	

42	helping	SMEs	
43	high	social	
44	ideas	spatially	
45	improve	statement	
46	in	strong	
47	increasing	sustainable	
48	innovative	tech	
49	integrated	themes	
50	international	transition	
51	is	vision	
52	its		
53	jobs		
54	knowledge-based		
55	medium		
56	middle		
57	modern		
58	more		
59	multidimensional		
60	national		
61	of		
62	own		
63	pioneer		
64	planned		
65	policies		
66	production		
67	provide		
68	providing		
69	quality		
70	region		
71	reputation		
72	rich		
73	road		
74	role		
75	services		
76	serving		
77	similar		
78	smes		
79	social		
80	spatially		
81	statement		
82	strong		
83	support		
84	sustainable		
85	take		
86	tech		
87	that		
88	the		
89	themes		
90	to		

91	transition		
92	Turkey		
93	vision		
94	with		

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES			
	Repeated Words Removed	Repeated Words and Articles, Particles, Adverbs, and Verbs Removed	Final List
1			
2	a	activities	develop
3	across	advantage	regional
4	activities	agency	production
5	advantage	balanced	sector
6	agency's	base	balanced
7	all		capacities
8	among	business	competitiveness
9	and	capacities	disparities
10	at	companies	economic
11	balanced	competitiveness	employment
12	base		innovation-oriented
13	better	continuously	skills
14	business	contribution	SMEs
15	can	country	social
16	capacities	creation	valueadded
17	companies	culture	national
18	competitiveness	demographic	companies
19	consolidate	differences	enterprises
20	continuously	disparities	high-tech
21	contribution	economic	spatial
22	country	education	global
23	creation	employment	R&D
24	culture	enhancement	territorial
25	decrease	enterprises	
26	demographic	establishment	
27	develop	exports	
28	differences	financial	
29	disparities	geographically	
30	economic	global	
31	education	growth	
32	employment	high	
33	enhancement	high-tech	
34	ensure	improve	
35	enterprises	inclusion	
36	establishment	individual	
37	exports	infrastructure	

38	financial	innovation-oriented	
39	geographically	institutional	
40	global	integration	
41	growth	level	
42	high	low-tech	
43	high-tech	management	
44	improve	national	
45	in	new	
46	inclusion	opportunity	
47	increase	physical	
48	individual	policies	
49	infrastructure	potential	
50	innovation-oriented	production	
51	institutional	quality	
52	integration	r&d	
53	level	regional	
54	low-tech	residential	
55	management	scale	
56	mid-	sector	
57	mobilize	services	
58	motivate	skills	
59	national	SMEs	
60	new	social	
61	of	spatial	
62	opportunity	stock	
63	overcome	territorial	
64	physical	transition	
65	policies	valueadded	
66	potential	weight	
67	production	window	
68	quality		
69	r&d		
70	reduce		
71	regional		
72	residential		
73	scale		
74	sector		
75	services		
76	skills		
77	SMEs		
78	social		
79	spatial		
80	stock		
81	support		
82	take		
83	territorial		
84	that		

85	the		
86	their		
87	through		
88	to		
89	transition		
90	turkey's		
91	utilize		
92	valueadded		
93	weight		
94	window		
95	within		

PRIORITY AXES			
	Repeated Words Removed	Repeated Words and Articles, Particles, Adverbs, and Verbs Removed	Final List
1	a	accessibility	activities
2	accessibility	accordance	agencies
3	accordance	activities	automotive
4	activities	adaptability	business
5	adaptability	adaptation	capacity
6	adaptation	agencies	clustering
7	agencies	analysis	collaboration
8	all	areas	competition/competitiveness
9	allow	auspices	cooperation
10	among	automotive	coordination
11	an	base	develop/developed/development
12	analysis	business	disadvantaged
13	and	capacity	discrimination
14	areas	capital	economy
15	assist	carried	education
16	at	centers	effective
17	attract	chain	efficiency
18	auspices	clustering	electronics
19	automotive	collaboration	employment
20	base	collecting	enterprise/entrepreneur/entrepreneurship
21	be	compatible	environment
22	become	competition	furniture
23	better	consideration	girls
24	between	convergence	growth
25	business	cooperation	industrial
26	by	coordination	information
27	capacity	country	international
28	capital	cross-border	interregional
29	carried	data	investment
30	centers	decisions	iron
31	chain	designed	labour

32	clustering	differences	machinery
33	collaboration	disadvantaged	market
34	collecting	discrimination	oizs
35	combat	economy	output
36	compatible	education	regional/regions
37	competition	effective	sectoral/sectors
38	consideration	efficiency	steel
39	contribute	electronics	sustainability
40	control	employment	trade
41	convergence	enrolment	unemployment
42	cooperation	enterprise	underdeveloped
43	coordination	environment	workers
44	country	evaluation	women
45	cross-border	exports	
46	data	food	
47	decisions	force	
48	decrease	forms	
49	designed	formulated	
50	determine	furniture	
51	develop	further	
52	differences	girls	
53	disadvantaged	goals	
54	discrimination	goods	
55	economy	governmentality	
56	education	green	
57	effective	growth	
58	efficiency	harmonization	
59	electronics	high-tech	
60	employment	holistic	
61	enable	HRD	
62	encouraged	human	
63	enhance	implementation	
64	enrolment	inclusive	
65	ensure	individual	
66	enterprise	industrial	
67	environment	information	
68	especially	initiatives	
69	established	institutional	
70	eu.	integration	
71	evaluation	international	
72	exports	investment	
73	food	iron	
74	for	labour	
75	force	learning	
76	forms	levels	
77	formulated	lifelong	
78	foster	linkage	
79	furniture	local	
80	further	machinery	

81	girls	manner	
82	goals	market	
83	goods	matching	
84	governmentality	ministry	
85	green	mobilizing	
86	growth	monitoring	
87	harmonization	network	
88	high-tech	non-governmental	
89	holistic	notably	
90	HRD	offering	
91	human	OIZs	
92	implementation	operating	
93	improve	opportunities	
94	in	output	
95	inclusive	outwardness	
96	increase	paper	
97	individual	participation	
98	industrial	particular	
99	information	people	
100	initiatives	poles	
101	institutional	policies	
102	integration	potentials	
103	international	priority	
104	interregional	private	
105	into	production	
106	investment	programming	
107	iron	provinces	
108	is	public	
109	labour	purpose	
110	learning	quality	
111	levels	raising	
112	lifelong	rates	
113	linkage	regional	
114	local	related	
115	machinery	relevant	
116	make	resources	
117	manner	restructuring	
118	market	results	
119	matching	rural	
120	mid-	sectoral	
121	ministry	share	
122	mobilizing	site	
123	monitoring	speed	
124	more	steel	
125	network	steps	
126	new	strategies	
127	non-governmental	strengthening	
128	notably	structure	

129	of	support	
130	offering	sustainability	
131	OIZs	system	
132	on	systematic	
133	operating	tasks	
134	opportunities	trade.	
135	other	traditional	
136	out	transportation	
137	output	trigger	
138	outwardness	turkey	
139	paper	underdeveloped	
140	participation	unemployment	
141	particular	users	
142	people	value	
143	poles	view	
144	policies	which	
145	potentials	white	
146	precipitate	women	
147	priority	wood	
148	private	workers	
149	production	workers	
150	programming	works	
151	promote	young	
152	provinces		
153	public		
154	purpose		
155	quality		
156	raising		
157	rates		
158	regional		
159	related		
160	relevant		
161	resources		
162	rest		
163	restructuring		
164	results		
165	retain		
166	rural		
167	sectoral		
168	serve		
169	share		
170	site		
171	speed		
172	steel		
173	steps		
174	strategies		
175	strengthening		
176	structure		
177	such		

178	support		
179	sustainability		
180	system”		
181	systematic		
182	taken		
183	tasks.		
184	that		
185	the		
186	their		
187	to		
188	trade.		
189	traditional		
190	transportation		
191	trigger		
192	Turkey		
193	under		
194	underdeveloped		
195	unemployment		
196	up		
197	updating		
198	use		
199	users		
200	value		
201	view		
202	way		
203	which		
204	white		
205	will		
206	with		
207	within		
208	women		
209	wood		
210	workers		
211	workers		
212	works		
213	young		

HORIZONTAL POLICY AREAS			
	Repeated Words Removed	Repeated Words and Articles, Particles, Adverbs, and Verbs Removed	Final List
1	a	accessibility	business
2	access	business	capacity
3	accessibility	capacity	civil
4	all	civil	collaboration
5	and	collaboration	companies
6	business	companies	competitiveness
7	capacity	competitiveness	concentration
8	civil	concentration	costs
9	civil	concerns	development
10	collaboration	costs	disadvantaged
11	companies	cross-border	economy
12	competitiveness	development	enterprises
13	concentration	disadvantaged	environment
14	concerns	economy	finance
15	costs	enterprises	infrastructure
16	cross-border	environment	institutional
17	develop	equal	international
18	development	finance	interregional
19	disadvantaged	geographic	investment
20	economy	goals	participation
21	enterprises)	good	protection
22	environment	governance	regional
23	equal	governmentality	resources
24	finance	green	sectoral
25	financed	harmonize	skills
26	for	human	SMEs
27	geographic	infrastructure	society
28	goals	input	sustainable
29	good	institutional	technological
30	governance	integral	trade
31	governmentality	international	transportation
32	green	interregional	women
33	harmonize	investment	
34	human	mandatory	
35	improve	medium	
36	infrastructure	men	
37	input	network	
38	institutional	opportunities	
39	integral	part	
40	international	participation	
41	interregional	persons	
42	investment	policies	

43	mandatory	practices	
44	medium	protection	
45	men	public	
46	men	regional	
47	network	resources	
48	of	sectoral	
49	opportunities	sized	
50	part	skills	
51	participation	SMEs	
52	persons	society	
53	policies	society	
54	practices	structural	
55	protection	support	
56	public	sustainable	
57	regional	technological	
58	resources	thematic	
59	sectoral	trade	
60	sized	transportation	
61	skills	women	
62	small		
63	SMEs'		
64	society		
65	society		
66	structural		
67	support		
68	sustainable		
69	technological		
70	the		
71	thematic		
72	to		
73	trade		
74	transportation		
75	under		
76	with		
77	women		